All Your Cluster-Grids Are Belong to Us: Monitoring the (in)Security of Infrastructure Monitoring Systems

Andrei Costin EURECOM, France

1st Workshop on Security & Privacy in the Cloud (SPC)30 Sep 2015, Florence ItalyEURECO

Agenda

- Introduction
- Overview of NMS
- Reconaissance
- Static+Dynamic Analysis
- Vulnerability Analysis
- Countermeasures
- Conclusion



Introduction What is Cloud Computing?

"When broken down, cloud computing is a specialized distributed computing model. Building upon the desirable characteristics of **cluster, grid, utility**, [...] to create a new computing paradigm"

J. Idziorek, Exploiting Cloud Utility Models for Profit and Ruin, 2012



Introduction What is HPC?

Typical HPC Workflow



Sophia Antipol.

Introduction What is NMS?

- NMS
 - Network Monitoring System
 - Monitoring systems for infrastructure, servers and networks



Introduction What is NMS?

- NMS
 - Network Monitoring System
 - Monitoring systems for infrastructure, servers and networks
- Where used?
 - HPC=High-Performance Computing
 - Grids
 - Clusters
 - Federation of Clusters
 - Cloud



Introduction What is NMS?



EURECOM

Overview of NMS What are the tools? Sanglia Nagios Zenõss





collectd OPEN SOURCE MONITORING TOOL http://www.tecmint.com







Overview of NMS What are the tools?

• Ganglia

"a scalable distributed monitoring system for High-Performance Computing (HPC) systems such as clusters and grids"



Overview of NMS What are the tools?

• Ganglia

"a scalable distributed monitoring system for High-Performance Computing (HPC) systems such as clusters and grids"

Cacti

"a complete network graphing solution"



Overview of NMS What are the tools?

• Ganglia

"a scalable distributed monitoring system for High-Performance Computing (HPC) systems such as clusters and grids"

Cacti

"a complete network graphing solution"

Observium

"an autodiscovering network monitoring platform supporting a wide range of hardware platforms and operating systems including Cisco, Windows, Linux, HP, Juniper, Dell, FreeBSD, Brocade, Netscaler, NetApp and many more. Observium seeks to provide a powerful yet simple and intuitive interface to the health and status of your network"





Overview of NMS Who uses them?

WHO USES GANGLIA?

Berkeley (the birthplace of ganglia) Twitter flickr last.fm OpenX Monetate San Diego Supercomputing Center (contributed great code to the project) Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT) National Aeronautics and Space Administration (NASA) National Institutes of Health (NIH) Reuters **Internet Archive** Industrial Light & Magic Wikipedia (check it out!) Virginia Tech (built the fastest supercomputer at any academic institution in the world using ganglia) Etsy Pandora Dow Chemical

Motorola Harvard D.E. Shaw Lucent CERN Cisco Sun (thanks for recommending ganglia for Grid Infrastructure!) HP Microsoft Dell (thanks for the hardware donation!) Cray Boeina Lockheed-Martin **GE Global Research** Cadence Design Systems nVidia Duke University Bank of America Queensland University of Technology Georgetown University UOL.com PriceGrabber.com **Ticket Master** Oinetia

Cummins freescale Sandia National Laboratories Rocketcalc Yale **Deutsches Elektronen-Synchrotron** bp Nortel LexisNexis Landmark SARA Bellsouth University of Pisa, Italy X-ISS Tennesee Tech University Princeton The Moving Picture Company University of Michigan Universite De Sherbrook The Royal Bank of Scotland U.S. Air Force Celgene Groundwork **Brookhaven National Laboratory** N.E.C. GlobeXplorer John Deere Xilinx Freddie Mac jeteye Tokyo Institute of Technology **Purdue University** Stanford and thousands of other people just ask Google.

Information Leakage What is leaked?

							RUCKS	Clusie	r Gang	па пер		undersing e port
Main	Search	Views	Aggregate	Graphs	Compare Hos	ts Events	Automati	c Rotation	Mobile			
cc-1	cc-102-1.msulocal Host Report for Tue, 25 Aug 2015 09:07:11 -0400											
Last	hour 2hr	4hr d	day week	month	year or from		to 📰			Go	Clear	
AGLT	2-ATLAS Grid	d > MSU T2	2 > cc-102-1	.msulocal								
Hos	Host Overview											
	This host is	s up and	running.									
								Time	and Stri	ng Metr	ics	
bootti	me					Fri, 15 May	y 2015 12:	:28:04 -0	400			
Gmor	d Started					Tue, 21 Ju	2015 10:	09:31 -04	100			
IP Ad	dress					10.10.129	.254					
Last F	Reported					0 days, 0:	00:18					
Locat	ion					102,1,0						
mach	ine_type					x86_64						
os_na	ime					Linux						
os_re	ease					2.6.32-504	4.8.1.el6.x	86_64				
ps												
ps-0						pid=20588	812, cmd=	slim_new	est, user=	glow, %	cpu=100.	36, %mem=3.10,
ps-1						pid=13508 vm=27419	85, cmd= 60	athena.p	y, user=u	satlas1, ʻ	%cpu=99.	70, %mem=4.64,
ps-2						pid=14347 vm=27390	26, cmd=)88	athena.p	y, user=u	satlas1, ʻ	%cpu=99.	70, %mem=4.66,



OS Details

- CVEs for Kernel
- NIST NVD, CVEdetails

Linux » Linux Kernel : All Versions

Sort Results By : Version Descending Version Ascending Number of Vulnerabilities Descending Num

Total number of versions found = 1772 Page : 1 (This Page) 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 1

Version	Language	Update	Edition	Number of Vulnerabilities	
2.6.0				489	Version Details Vulnerabilities
2.6.1				478	Version Details Vulnerabilities
2.6.2				465	Version Details Vulnerabilities
2.6.10				465	Version Details Vulnerabilities
2.6.11				457	Version Details Vulnerabilities



OS Details

- CVEs for Kernel
- Linux Kernel 2.6.32

Linux » Linux Kernel » 2.6.32 RC4 : Vulnerability Statistics

Vulnerabilities (182) Related Metasploit Modules (Cpe Name:cpe:/o:linux:linux_kernel:2.6.32:rc4)

Vulnerability Feeds & Widgets

Vulnerability Trends Over Time

Year	# of Vulnerabilities	DoS	Code Execution	Overflow	Memory Corruption	Sql Injection	xss	Directory Traversal	Http Response Splitting	Bypass something	Gain Information	Gain Privileges	CSRF	File Inclusion	# of exploits
<u>2009</u>	14	<u>11</u>		<u>3</u>	1						1	<u>4</u>			
<u>2010</u>	75	<u>37</u>		<u>9</u>	<u>4</u>					4	<u>25</u>	<u>Z</u>			<u>3</u>
<u>2011</u>	69	<u>50</u>		<u>16</u>	<u>6</u>					1	<u>20</u>	<u>8</u>			<u>1</u>
<u>2012</u>	4	<u>3</u>								1					
<u>2013</u>	12	Z		<u>3</u>	<u>1</u>					2	<u>1</u>	<u>2</u>			
<u>2014</u>	1	1													
<u>2015</u>	7	2			1					2	1	1			
Total	182	<u>111</u>		<u>31</u>	<u>13</u>					<u>10</u>	<u>48</u>	<u>22</u>			<u>4</u>
% Of All		61.0	0.0	17.0	7.1	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	5.5	26.4	12.1	0.0	0.0	

EURECOM

Usernames

- Login Bruteforce
- Social Engineering Emails (e.g., phishing, drive-by)

• Social Engineering Toolkit (SET)

Welcome to the SET E-Mail attack method. This module allows you

to specially craft email messages and send them to a large (or small) number of people with attached fileformat malicious payloads. If you want to spoof your email address, be sure "Sendmail" is installed (it is installed in BT4) and change the config/set_config SENDMAIL=OFF flag to SENDMAIL=ON.

There are two options, one is getting your feet wet and letting SET do everything for you (option 1), the second is to create your own FileFormat payload and use it in your own attack. Either way, good luck and enjoy

- 1. Perform a Mass Email Attack
- 2. Create a FileFormat Payload
- 3. Create a Social-Engineering Template
- 4. Return to Main Menu



- Commands, Resource Usage
 - Mimicry and Blending Attacks
- How?
 - Learn normal system status/behaviour Xn
 - When in malicious state Xm, stick as close as possibly to the legitimate state Xn
 A(Xm) = argmin d(Xm, Xn), s.t., d(Xm, Xn) < D



Reconaissance Types

- Active
 - Tools: NMAP, AMAP, Nessus
 - Pros: +/- accurate, wide range of info
 - Cons: noisy, triggers IPS/IDS



Reconaissance Types

- Active
 - Tools: NMAP, AMAP, Nessus
 - Pros: +/- accurate, wide range of info
 - Cons: noisy, triggers IPS/IDS

- Passive
 - Search dorks: Google, Shodan
 - Attack: Information Leakage and non-Authorization



- Google dorks Ganglia
 - intitle:"Cluster Report"
 - intitle:"Grid Report"
 - intitle:"Node View"
 - intitle:"Host Report"
 - intitle:"Ganglia:: "
 - "Ganglia Web Frontend version 2.0.0"



- Google dorks Cacti
 - inurl:"/cacti/graph_view.php"
 - intitle:"cacti" inurl:"graph_view.php"



Google dorks – Cacti

graphs										
Graphs -> Tree Mode										
B AGLT2_UM B APC	Presets: Last 4 Hours V From: 2015-08-23 14:04 To: 2015-08-23 18:04 A to v refresh clear									
dCache_Info	Search: Graphs per Page: 30 V Thumbhails: go Clear									
Default Tree	<< Previous Showing Graphs 1 to 30 of 102 [1,2,3,4]									
	Tree: Default Tree-> Host: umfs13.adt2.org									
Tier2 Services	Crank Template: Ket MIR - Leased in Users									
Host:	Graph Template: Host MIB - Logged In Osers	7								
Host: linat06	umfsl3.aglt2.org - Logged in Users									
Host: linat07	1.0 †									
Host: linat08	0.8									
Host: umfs02	۲ 0.6									
Host: UMT3INT03.AGLT2.ORG	9.4									
Host: UMT3INT02.AGET2.ORG	0.2									
Host: umdist05	0.0									
Host: umfs11	14:20 14:40 15:00 15:20 15:40 16:00 16:20 16:40 17:00 17:20 17:40 18:00									
Host: umfs13 aglt2 org	From 2015/08/23 14:04:34 To 2015/08/23 18:04:34									
Host: RAC J88LMH1	Users Current: 0 Average: 0 Maximum: 0									
Host: RAC 2FD6LH1]								
Host: RAC_FK1FNH1	Graph Template: Host MIB - Processes									
Host: RAC_H88LMH1	umfs13.aglt2.org - Processes									
Host: RAC_BZD7VC1	500 1									
Host: umfs12	400									
	14:20 14:40 15:00 15:20 15:40 16:00 16:20 16:40 17:00 17:20 17:40 18:00									
	From 2015/08/23 14:04:34 To 2015/08/23 18:04:34									
Host: c-4-19	Running Drocoscos Current, 447 Average, 450									
"Host: c-5-37	Maximum: 460									
Host: c-5-38		J								
Host: c-5-39	Graph Template: Host MIB - Storage									
Host: c-4-40	umfs13.aglt2.org - Storage on / 🔍	IV.								
Host: c-6-13										

Reconaissance Passive and Recursive • Google dorks – Cacti → Ganglia

graphs	
Graphs -> Tree Mode	
	Presets: Last 4 Hours 🔻 From: 2015-08-23 14:04 🖾 To: 2015-08-23 18:04 🖾 🗳 1 Day 🔻 🕨 refresh Clear
	Search: Graphs per Page: 30 Thumbnails: 90 Clear
dCache_Info	
- Default Tree	<< Previous Showing Graphs 1 to 30 of 102 [1,2,3,4]
Host: Localhost	Tree: Default Tree-> Host: umfs13.agit2.org
Tier2 Services	Graph Template: Host MIB - Logged in Users
Host:	
Host: linat06	umfs13.aglt2.org - pgged in Users
Host: linat07	
Host: umfs02	6.8
Host: UMT3INT03 AGLT2 OPG	2 0.6
Host: UMT3INT02 AGLT2 ORG	9 0.4
Host: UMT3INT01.AGLT2.ORG	0.2
Host: umdist05	0.0
Host: umfs11	14:20 14:40 15:00 15:20 15:40 16:00 16:20 16:40 17:00 17:20 17:40 18:00
Host: umfs13.aglt2.org	FIOII 2013/08/23 14:04:34 10 2013/06/23 10:04:34
Host: RAC_J88LMH1	Users Current: 0 Average: 0 Maximum: 0
	Graph Template: Host MIB - Processes
	umfs13.aglt2.org - Processes 🖉 🔍
Host: RAC_BZD7VC1	500 [†]
Host: umfs12	
Host: dc2-4-15	
	14:20 14:40 15:00 15:20 15:40 16:00 16:20 16:40 17:00 17:20 17:40 18:00
	From 2015/08/23 14:04:34 To 2015/08/23 18:04:34
Host: c-4-19	Running Processes Current: 447 Average: 450
Host: c-5-37	Maximum: 460
Host: c-5-38	
Host: c-5-39	Graph Template: Host MIB - Storage
Host: C-4-40	umfs13.aglt2.org - Storage on / 💽

0 p 11 1 4 71 11 L

Reconaissance Passive and **Recursive**

- Google dorks Cacti → Ganglia
 - www.aglt2.org



ATLAS Computing and Muon Calibration Center



Home	Computing	Calibration	Projects	General	Media	People	Wiki		Simulated black	hole event in ATLAS More Images
AGLT2 C	verview ATLA	S Information	Higgs Boson	Panel						
News								Cu	irrent Statistics	
Super One Se	Computing 20 erver, 100 Gbp	14: os over the W	W or	We have 3567 Condor jobs (2944 running on 6066 cores, 614 idle, 9 held)						
Software Driven Dynamic Hybrid Networks With Terabit/sec Science Data Flows More information								T.	tal Slate 3163 Co	res 6826
								<u>Jo</u>	<u>ob status page</u>	
Materia	ils and photos	from the HEP	IX Fall 2013	3 Workshop) at AGLT	2 UM.				



Reconaissance Passive and Recursive

• Google dorks – Cacti \rightarrow Ganglia

www.aglt2.org Job Status Page



Reconaissance Passive and **Recursive**

- Google dorks Cacti → Ganglia
 - From Cacti reached also to Ganglia!

					ROCKS	Cluster	Ganglia	Report	suburchongo met
Main	Searc	h Views	Aggregate Gra	phs Compare Host	s Events Automa	tic Rotation	Mobile		
					0.07.11 0.00				
cc-1	02-1.m	sulocal H	ost Report for I	ue, 25 Aug 2015	09:07:11 -0400				
Last	hour	2hr 4hr	day week mo	onth year or from		to		Go Clear	
AGLT	2-ATLAS	Grid > MSU	T2 > cc-102-1.ms	ulocal					
Hos	t Overvie	W							
	This hos	st is up an	d running.						
						Time	and String	Metrics	
boottii	me				Fri, 15 May 2015 1	2:28:04 -04	00		
Gmon	d Started				Tue, 21 Jul 2015 10	0:09:31 -04	00		
IP Ad	dress				10.10.129.254				
Last F	Reported				0 days, 0:00:18				
Locati	ion				102,1,0				
machi	ine_type				x86_64				
os_na	ime				Linux				
os_rel	lease				2.6.32-504.8.1.el6	.x86_64			
ps									
ps-0					pid=2058812, cmd	=slim_newe	est, user=glo	ow, %cpu=1	00.36, %mem=3.10,
ps-1					pid=1350885, cmd vm=2741960	=athena.py	, user=usatl	as1, %cpu=	99.70, %mem=4.64,
ps-2					pid=1434726, cmd vm=2739088	=athena.py	, user=usatl	as1, %cpu=	99.70, %mem=4.66,



The Washington Post



 \bigcirc

CNMMoney

Explore the Internet of Things

Use Shodan to discover which of your devices are connected to the Internet, where they are located and who is using them.

Monitor Network Security

Keep track of all the computers on your network that are directly accessible from the Internet. Shodan lets you understand your digital footprint.

Daubladet



See the Big Picture

Websites are just one part of the Internet. There are power plants, Smart TVs, refrigerators and much more that can be found with Shodan!



BBC News

Get a Competitive Advantage

Who is using your product? Where are they located? Use Shodan to perform empirical market intelligence.



2

EURECOM

- Exposed web interfaces
 - 364 Ganglia
 - ~43K nodes (web info leak)
 - ~1370 clusters
 - ~490 grids
 - 5K Cacti and 2K Observium



- Exposed web interfaces
 - 364 Ganglia
 - ~43K nodes (web info leak)
 - ~1370 clusters
 - ~490 grids
 - 5K Cacti and 2K Observium
- Exposed daemons
 - ~40K publicly exposed Ganglia gmond nodes (XML Info Leak)



TABLE I

DISTRIBUTION AND COUNTS OF UNIQUE HOSTS, SPLIT BY GANGLIA'S MODULE AND COUNTRY OF HOSTS' IP.

Country (iso2 code)	Ganglia Gmond	Ganglia Web Frontend
US	51%	32%
CN	10%	4%
KR	8%	8%
ES	6%	3%
FR	4%	3%
TW	3%	7%
DE	3%	3%
IT	$\approx 1\%$	3%
СН	$\ll 1\%$	5%
Others	14%	32%
Total (count)	39553	364

• 43K nodes on 364 Ganglia Web Interfaces



- 43K nodes on 364 Ganglia Web Interfaces
- 120 main kernel versions
 - 411 kernel sub-versions



- 43K nodes on 364 Ganglia Web Interfaces
- 120 main kernel versions
 - 411 kernel sub-versions
- Kernel version 2.6.32 most popular
 - Runs on 38% of the 43K hosts
 - Hundreds of vulnerabilities in all 2.6.32 kernels (according to CVEdetails)



- 43K nodes on 364 Ganglia Web Interfaces
- 120 main kernel versions
 - 411 kernel sub-versions
- Kernel version 2.6.32 most popular
 - Runs on 38% of the 43K hosts
 - Hundreds of vulnerabilities in all 2.6.32 kernels (according to CVEdetails)
- Secured kernels
 - grsecurity on 9 hosts (only!)
 - hardened-sources on 6 hosts (only!)



amzn kernels on 45 hosts (~0.1%)

inurl:"/ganglia/?c=SamsungProduction"

Web Images Videos News Shopping More - Search tools

About 38 results (0.45 seconds)

Ganglia:: monitoring-master4.localdomain Host Report ec2-54-225-183-154.compute-1.amazonaws.com/ganglia?c=SamsungProd...

Feb 17, 2015 - Invoke automatic rotation system. Automatic rotation rotates all of the graphs/metrics specified in a view waiting 30 seconds in between each.

Ganglia:: mongodb3 Host Report

ec2-54-225-183-154.compute-1.amazonaws.com/ganglia?c=SamsungProd...

Feb 17, 2015 - Invoke automatic rotation system. Automatic rotation rotates all of the graphs/metrics specified in a view waiting 30 seconds in between each.

Ganglia:: ip-10-65-2-155.ec2.internal Host Report ec2-54-225-183-154.compute-1.amazonaws.com/ganglia?c=SamsungProd...

Feb 17, 2015 - Invoke automatic rotation system. Automatic rotation rotates all of the graphs/metrics specified in a view waiting 30 seconds in between each.

Ganglia:: ip-10-113-175-12.ec2.internal Host Report ec2-54-225-183-154.compute-1.amazonaws.com/ganglia?c=SamsungProd...

Feb 17, 2015 - Invoke automatic rotation system. Automatic rotation rotates all of the graphs/metrics specified in a view waiting 30 seconds in between each.



• 364 Ganglia Web Frontends

• Only 42 (i.e., 11.5%) run HTTPS

- Only 16 (i.e., 4.4%) run trusted* HTTPS
 - *Did not perform tests of weak/flawed HTTPS implementations



- Static analysis
 - "Static analysis is the process of testing an application by examining its source code, byte code or application binaries for conditions leading to a security vulnerability, without actually running it."
- Tools
 - We use RIPS for Ganglia Web Frontend (PHP)
 - More tools



- Dynamic analysis
 - "Dynamic analysis is the process of testing the application by running it."
- Tools
 - We use Arachni Scanner for Ganglia Web Frontend



- Analysis data
 - 25 Ganglia versions (static + dynamic)
 - 4 JobMonarch plugin versions (static only)
 - 35 Cacti versions (static only)
 - 1 Observium version (static only)



- Ganglia
 - Between 87 and 145 total reports per version
 - Between 43 and 92 XSS reports per version



- Ganglia
 - Between 87 and 145 total reports per version
 - Between 43 and 92 XSS reports per version
- Cacti
 - Between 189 and 400 total reports per version
 - Between 92 and 265 XSS reports per version



- Ganglia
 - Between 87 and 145 total reports per version
 - Between 43 and 92 **XSS** reports per version
- Cacti
 - Between 189 and 400 total reports per version
 - Between 92 and 265 **XSS** reports per version
- Observium
 - 82 total reports per version
 - 52 XSS reports per version



- Ganglia
 - Between 87 and 145 total reports per version
 - Between 43 and 92 XSS reports per version
- Cacti
 - Between 189 and 400 total reports per version
 - Between 92 and 265 XSS reports per version
- Observium
 - 82 total reports per version
 - 52 XSS reports per version
- Some totals
 - 7553 XSS reports
 - Manual triage and confirmation does not scale!



Version / Vulnerability Type	CE	HTRS	CI	HI	PFC	UNS	SQLI	LDAPI	FI	FM	FD	XSS	TOTAL/version
carti_0.8	0	68	2	0	21	5	0	0	0	1	0	02	180
cacti 0.8 1	ŏ	68	2	ŏ	21	5	ŏ	ő	ŏ	1	ŏ	92	107
cacti-0.8.7	ŏ	68	2	ŏ	21	5	ŏ	ő	ŏ	1	ň	05	192
cacti-0.8.2	ő	68	2	ő	21	5	0	0	ŏ	1		9.5	192
cacti-0.8.2a	ő	70	2	ŏ	21	5	ő	0	ŏ	1	ő	102	201
cacti-0.8.3	ŏ	70	2	ŏ	21	5	ŏ	ŏ	ŏ	1	ŏ	102	201
cacti-0.8.4	ŏ	75	4	ŏ	23	5	ň	ň	ŏ	i	ž	08	201
cacti-0.8.5	ő	79	4	ŏ	2.5	5	ő	ő	ŏ	1	2	112	200
cacti 0.8 5a		70	- 4	ő	20	5		0	ő	1	2	115	229
cacti 0 8 6	2	70	5	ĩ	2.5	7		0	ň	7	5	160	229
cacti-0.8.6	2	78	5	1	2.5	2	ő	0	1	2	6	161	291
cacti-0.8.6b	2	78	5	1	25	2	ő	ő	i	2	4	161	295
cacti-0.8.60	2	79	5	1	25	2	ő	ő	;	2	5	161	202
cacti-0.8.6d	2	79	5	1	25	2	ŏ	ő	÷	2	5	160	292
cacti-0.8.6a	2	78	5	1	25	2	ŏ	ő	÷	2	5	170	310
cacti-0.8.6f	2	78	6	1	25	2	ŏ	ŏ	i	2	5	180	312
cacti-0.8.6g	2	78	6	i	27	7	ŏ	ŏ	i	8	5	170	314
cacti-0.8.6h	2	78	6	i	20	7	ŏ	ŏ	i	8	5	190	327
cacti-0.8 6i	2	78	5	i	20	7	ŏ	ň	i	7	5	261	306
cacti-0.8.6i	2	78	5	i	29	7	ŏ	ő	i	2	5	265	400
cacti-0.8.6k	2	78	5	i	29	2	ŏ	ŏ	i	2	5	234	360
cacti-0.8.7	2	78	3	i	30	10	ŏ	ĭ	i	7	5	205	343
cacti-0.8.7a	2	78	3	1	30	10	ň	;	i	2	5	205	343
cacti-0.8.7h	2	78	3	1	30	10	ŏ	1	i	2	5	154	202
cacti-0.8.7c	2	78	2	1	31	11	ŏ	;	÷	10	3	202	242
cacti-0.8.7d	2	78	3	1	31	11	ŏ	1	i	10	3	202	347
cacti-0.8.7e	2	78	3	i	31	11	ŏ	i	i	10	3	200	3.40
cacti-0.8.7a	2	77	2	1	20	11	ň		i	8	3	141	275
cacti-0.8.7b	33	75	2	1	1	11	ŏ	ő	i	8	3	150	204
cacti-0.8.7i	33	75	2	1	1	11	ŏ	ň	i	8	3	150	294
cacti-0.8 7i-PIA_3 1	38	76	2	1	1		ŏ	ň	;	8	3	160	311
cacti-0.8.8	36	76	2	1	1	11	ŏ	ŏ	2	8	3	169	300
cacti-0.8.8a	36	76	2	1	1	11	ŏ	ŏ	2	8	ž	169	300
cacti-0.8.8b	36	76	2	i	i	11	ŏ	ŏ	2	8	3	169	309
cacti-0.8.8c	36	77	2	i	i	11	ŏ	ŏ	2	8	3	204	345
			-				÷		-	÷	÷		0.0
ganglia_jobmonarch-1.0	0	0	1	0	3	2	0	0	0	0	0	1	7
ganglia_jobmonarch-1.1	0	0	1	0	3	2	0	0	0	0	0	1	7
ganglia_jobmonarch-1.1.1	0	0	1	0	3	2	0	0	0	0	0	1	7
ganglia_jobmonarch-1.1.2	0	0	1	0	3	2	0	0	0	0	0	1	7
ganglia-web-3.4.1	0	3	1	1	2	14	0	0	0	16	14	89	140
ganglia-web-3.4.2	0	3	1	1	2	14	0	0	0	16	14	90	141
ganglia-web-3.5.0	0	3	1	1	2	14	0	0	0	16	15	87	139
ganglia-web-3.5.10	0	3	1	1	2	13	0	0	0	13	11	43	87
ganglia-web-3.5.1	0	3	1	1	2	15	0	0	0	16	16	89	143
ganglia-web-3.5.11	0	3	3	1	2	13	0	0	0	12	12	46	92
ganglia-web-3.5.12	0	3	3	1	2	13	0	0	0	12	12	46	92
ganglia-web-3.5.2	0	3	1	1	2	15	0	0	0	16	15	90	143
ganglia-web-3.5.3	0	3	1	1	2	15	0	0	0	16	15	92	145
ganglia-web-3.5.4	0	3	1	1	2	15	0	0	0	16	15	92	145
ganglia-web-3.5.7	0	3	1	1	2	15	0	0	0	16	12	60	110
ganglia-web-3.5.8	0	3	1	1	2	13	0	0	0	13	11	43	87
ganglia-web-3.6.2	0	2	2	1	2	17	0	0	0	12	11	47	94
gweb-2.0.0	0	3	1	1	2	5	0	0	0	7	8	69	96
gweb-2.1.1	0	3	3	1	2	5	0	0	0	9	10	74	107
gweb-2.1.2	0	3	3	1	2	5	0	0	0	10	10	74	108
gweb-2.1.3	0	3	3	1	2	5	0	0	0	10	10	74	108
gweb-2.1.5	0	3	1	1	2	5	0	0	0	8	8	72	100
g web-2.1.6	0	3	3	1	2	5	0	0	0	9	10	76	109
gweb-2.1.7	0	3	3	1	2	5	0	0	0	9	10	76	109
gweb-2.1.8	0	3	1	1	2	6	0	0	0	13	10	75	111
gweb-2.2.0	0	3	1	1	2	12	0	0	0	20	12	92	143
gweb-3.3.0	0	3	1	1	2	13	0	0	0	18	15	92	145
gweb-3.3.1	0	3	1	1	2	13	0	0	0	18	14	92	144
observium	0	1	2	0	3	3	4	0	- 9	5	4	51	82
TOTAL/vulnerability	286	2727	166	50	798	556	4	6	40	536	408	7553	-





Fig. 1. Vulnerabilities in Ganglia Web Frontend found statically with RIPS. Distribution by Ganglia's version and vulnerability type.





Fig. 2. Vulnerabilities in Ganglia Web Frontend found dynamically with Arachni. Distribution by Ganglia's version and vulnerability type.



Fig. 1. Vulnerabilities in Ganglia Web Frontend found statically with RIPS. Distribution by Ganglia's version and vulnerability type.



Fig. 2. Vulnerabilities found dynamically with Arachni. Distribution by Ganglia's version and vulnerability type.



- 364 Ganglia Web Interfaces
 - 193 of them (i.e., 53%) run Ganglia Web ver < 3.5.1

CVE-2012-3448

Name	CVE-2012-3448
Description	Unspecified vulnerability in Ganglia Web before 3.5.1 allows remote attackers to execute arbitrary PHP code via unknown attack vectors.
Source	CVE (at NVD; oss-sec, fulldisc, OSVDB, EDB, Metasploit, Red Hat, Ubuntu, Gentoo, SuSE, Mageia, more)
References	DSA-2610-1
NVD severity	high (attack range: remote)
Debian Bugs	683584



- 364 Ganglia Web Interfaces
 - 193 of them (i.e., 53%) run Ganglia Web ver < 3.5.1

CVE-2012-3448

Name	CVE-2012-3448		
Description	Unspecified vulnerability in Ganglia Web before 3.5.	allows remote attackers to execute arbitrary PHP code v	a unknown attack vectors.
Source	CVE (at NVD; oss-sec, fulldisc, OSVDB, EDB, Metas	oit Red Hat Ubuntu Gentoo SuSE Mageia more)	
References	DSA-2610-1		
NVD severity	high (attack range: remote)		
Debian Bugs	683584		



Vulnerability Analysis

• CVE-2012-3448





Vulnerability Analysis

- CVE-2012-3448
- Exploit DB 38030

Ganglia Web Frontend < 3.5.1 - PHP Code Execution

EDB-1D: 38030	CVE: 2012-3448	OSVDB-ID: 84240		
Verified: ×	Author: Andrei Costin	Published: 2015-08-31		
Download Exploit: 🗟 Source 🗋 Raw	Download Vulnerable App: 📥			

« Previous Exploit





N

Countermeasures

- Periodic upgrade to latest versions
 - Need better coding practices for NMS
 - Manual patching where applicable



Countermeasures

- Periodic upgrade to latest versions
 - Need better coding practices for NMS
 - Manual patching where applicable
- Password protect
 - E.g., basic HTTP authentication



Countermeasures

- Periodic upgrade to latest versions
 - Need better coding practices for NMS
 - Manual patching where applicable
- Password protect
 - E.g., basic HTTP authentication
- HTTPS
 - Not self-signed certificates!



Contributions

 First to systematically analyze at large scale the risks and vulnerabilities posed by the use of web monitoring tools



Contributions

 First to systematically analyze at large scale the risks and vulnerabilities posed by the use of web monitoring tools

- Collected and analyzed the internal details of networks and systems of a large number of grid and cluster environments
 - Investigated the risks of such data being openly available to the large public



- Large number of NMS web interfaces publicly exposed
 - Too many run obsolete exploitable versions (~53%)
 - Too few run proper HTTPS (~4.4%)



- Large number of NMS web interfaces publicly exposed
 - Too many run obsolete exploitable versions (~53%)
 - Too few run proper HTTPS (~4.4%)
- Big amount of infrastructure details publicly exposed
 - More than 40K nodes



- Large number of NMS web interfaces publicly exposed
 - Too many run obsolete exploitable versions (~53%)
 - Too few run proper HTTPS (~4.4%)
- Big amount of infrastructure details publicly exposed
 - More than 40K nodes
- Many vulnerabilities reported in NMS tools



- Large number of NMS web interfaces publicly exposed
 - Too many run obsolete exploitable versions (~53%)
 - Too few run proper HTTPS (~4.4%)
- Big amount of infrastructure details publicly exposed
 - More than 40K nodes
- Many vulnerabilities reported in NMS tools
- Privacy and security of cloud monitoring is not yet completely sufficient



Reference

• A. Costin, "All your cluster-grids are belong to us: Monitoring the (in)security of infrastructure monitoring systems", Proceedings of the 1st IEEE Workshop on Security and Privacy in the Cloud (SPC), Florence Italy, September 2015.



Thank You! Questions?

{name.surname}@eurecom.fr



Andrei Costin 63